

HYPERTEXTUALITY:

Modes of Reading in Ottoman Poetry as Redefined by the Computer Age

Our encounter with the structuralist account of how human beings create and understand linguistic meaning has taught us reject the illusion of essential connections between words and "things." We are rather less naive than we were about believing that dictionary definitions come along with words from the very first, and more inclined to accept that meaning is created out of a lengthy and complex process of differentiating through experience between quite arbitrary signs. Post-structurally, we have also learned that the nature of the meaning-creating experience varies widely from group to group and from time to time according to social circumstances and deeply seated habits of seeking and wielding power and control. As a result, our notion of what it means to read has changed as our interest in "readings" and "readers" has grown.

As literary scholars we may mourn the loss of timeless truths passing unscathed down the corridors of time and view with alarm the position in which our own readings are placed by this loss. However, we can also welcome the emergence of "readers" or "audiences" as aspects of our study of how literary objects work in various contexts. The reader or audience as much as the author embodies the meaning

creating activity of a group and the set of conditions and assumptions that make meaning possible. In the past, we subsumed our intuition about the existence of such conditions, assumptions, and activities under the notion of 'sensibility.' Sensibility described--rather generally and unanalytically--a knowledge of how certain classes of art were to be understood, a knowledge that included a sense of group, social class, historical development, language subset, and so on.

For the most part, the study of Ottoman Poetry has depended on a continuity of sensibility. At the root of our understanding, even the understanding of Westerners writing far from Turkey, were the readings of people who still embodied the Ottoman sensibility, people who were able to know things in the way Ottomans did. The crisis of the Ottoman branch of Turkish literary study today is the inevitable and immanent end of that continuity. Such an end leaves us face to face with the need to replace or recreate sensibility artificially, to understand explicitly how sensibility works and to use that understanding to replace it with some as yet unnamed way of knowing or way of studying how ways of knowing come to be.

It is the purpose of this paper to indicate some ways in which very common, accessible, and uncomplicated uses of computers can dramatically alter the dimensions in which we read Ottoman poetic texts and the ways we 'know' Ottoman poetic contexts. Since the computer is primarily a mechanism for filing, sorting, and displaying information, its capabilities are limited by the amount of information available to it in a form it can manipulate. In the case of Ottoman poetry, the ideal body of information would be a representative sample of all Ottoman poems from all periods as well as a similar sample of

ANDREWS:3

Persian and, perhaps, Çagatay and Urdu poems. What is actually available to us right now are electronic text versions of three Ottoman *divans*: those of Revani and Fevri, which were edited using the computer, and that of Necâti, which was input from the Tarlan edition for comparative purposes. Thus what is to follow is a demonstration of the potential of one method for reading in a computer environment and not a comprehensive study of any of the material used for demonstration.

The most general difference that the computer can make in our readings is indicated by the title-word ``hypertextuality,'' a somewhat tongue-in-cheek use of a neologism found in the jargons of computer experts and literary theorists referring here to an increased ability to read, in a very short space of time, ``behind'' or ``beyond'' the text into the realm of poetic contexts, into the ``text-of-texts'' which informs all particular instances. As a demonstration of *how* this kind of hypertextuality works, let us begin with a sample poem and a simple issue.

1. a. Şol serv gibi kâmet-i dil-cûya ne dîrsin
b. Şol güller ile sünbül-i hoş-bûya ne dîrsin
2. a. Hiç aîmayalum hâl ü haţ u zülfini nâşih
b. Şol şive ile hâlet-i ebrûya ne dîrsin
3. a. Bir hûyuñ ile şöfi cihâna şıgamazsin
b. Üftâdelerüñ itdügi yâhûya ne dîrsin
4. a. Cânânelerüñ va'desi çok 'âşıkâ cânâ
b. Gayrıyı kıyalum hele pehlûya ne dîrsin
5. a. Zâhid dir imiş tevbelüyem câm-ı şerâba
b. Bi'llâhi Revânî ya şu bed-hûya ne dîrsin

ANDREWS:4

What do you have to say about that cypress-like, heart-hunter of a body
What do you have to say about those roses and that sweet-smelling
hyacinth?

Oh counselor, let's not mention that mole and cheek-down and curl?
But what would you have to say about the state of the eyebrow, with
that (enticing) way of behaving?

Oh pious one, your nature is such that you cannot adapt yourself to
this earth,
But then what do you say about what the fallen ones do?

The darlings make plenty of promises to the lover, oh my beloved!
Let's put all else aside and see what you have to say only about sitting
close together?

The zealot says, let us repent of the cup of wine,
By God, Revani, what do you have to say to this ill-tempered one?

As an example, let us pretend that it is not clear to us what the
poet means, in the second hemistich of the first line, when he speaks
of "those roses and that sweet-smelling hyacinth." In our normal
mode of creating a meaning we might first look for enlightenment in a
dictionary or other reference material. Ultimately we might ask
someone who "knows" Ottoman poetry. Ordinarily even a scholarly
reader would not consider searching the poet's whole divan to see how
the vocabulary in question might have been used elsewhere, and it is
far less likely that a reader would go on to do the same with the
divans of other poets in addition. Needless to say this process would
be quite time consuming and constructing a reading based on such a
process would have taken many months or even years. However, the
readings suggested by the dictionary or the "expert" are themselves a
distillation of the experience of a number of uses in a number of poems by
a number of poets. Thus the dictionary and "expert" are, in a sense,
tools for short-cutting the search and comparison process and
compacting it into a time period compatible with actual reading.

ANDREWS:5

Similarly, the ``expert's'' brain and the computer are roughly analagous tools for search and comparison, the former orders of magnitude faster and more sophisticated, the latter with more accurate recall. Although it is slow and clumsy in comparison to the brain, the computer allows us to ask a text or texts directly for information corresponding to the accumulations of data that underly the expert's intuition. For example, using our ``roses\hyacinths'' half-line we could ask the following questions and receive almost immediate answers [which will be represented by copies of the relevant computer screens]:

Questions: How often are ``rose (gül)'' and ``hyacinth (sünbül)'' used by the poet (Revâni)? Are they common words? How often are they used together by this poet? How often are they used together by other poets? In what contexts are ``hyacinth'' and ``rose'' used together?

The following is a screen giving the results of a quick computer search using the commercial program ``WORDCRUNCHER'' to find all cases of the use of the word ``gül (rose)'' and of the word ``sünbül (hyacinth)'' in the divan of Revani.

Filename: RGAZEL [REVANI]

W C V i e w

Search Bounds: InActive

Combine Information

Combine Description: Finding every case where gül/gülde/gülden/... occurs
within 20 characters, before or after sünbül/sünbüli/...

Matched Words	gül/gülde/gülden/...	sünbül/sünbüli/...	Occurrences
			written to
Number Read	213	25	Output List
Total in Text	213	25	6
			0.00 sec
[Enter] View References. [F2] Use with another word			

First Word List	Total=	213	Second Word List	Total=	25
6. güli	2		1. sünbül	13	
7. gülinüñ	1		2. sünbüli	1	
8. güller	28		3. sünbüller	4	
9. güllerdür	1		4. sünbülüñ	2	
10. gülleri	3		5. sünbül.i	5	
11. güllerin	1				
12. güllerle	4				
13. güllerüñ	2				
14. gül.i	19				

Below is the same information for the divans of Necati and Fevri.

Combine Information

Combine Description: Finding every case where gül/güli/gülinüñ/... occurs
within 20 characters, before or after sünbül/sünbüldürür/...

Matched Words	gül/güli/gülinüñ/...	sünbül/sünbüldürür/..	Occurrences
			written to
Number Read	232	29	Output List
Total in Text	232	29	4
			0.00 sec
[Enter] View References. [F2] Use with another word			

First Word List	Total=	232	Second Word List	Total=	29
2. güli	7		1. sünbül	13	
3. gülinüñ	1		2. sünbüldürür	1	
4. güller	12		3. sünbülinden	1	
5. gülleri	5		4. sünbüller	1	
6. güllerini	2		5. sünbüllerüñe	1	
7. güllerinüñ	1		6. sünbüllük	1	
8. güllerle	2		7. sünbülüñ	6	
9. güllerüñ	1		8. sünbül.i	5	
10. gül.i	30				

Combine Information

Combine Description: Finding every case where gül/gülde/güle/güli/...

occurs within 20 characters, before or after sünbül/sünbül-sâ/...

Matched Words	gül/gülde/güle/güli/.	sünbül/sünbül-sâ/...	Occurrences
			written to
Number Read	97	20	Output List
Total in Text	97	20	4
			0.00 sec
[Enter] View References.		[F2] Use with another word	

First Word List	Total=	97	Second Word List	Total=	20
1. gül	71		1. sünbül	16	
2. gülde	1		2. sünbül-sâ	1	
3. güle	4		3. sünbülüm	1	
4. güli	3		4. sünbülün	1	
5. gülidür	1		5. sünbül.i	1	
6. gülin	1				
7. güller	2				
8. gülleri	1				
9. gül.i	13				

On the basis of this much data we can ``know'' that the word ``rose'' is quite common (although in its non-compounded forms surprisingly less common in Fevri). ``Hyacinth,'' on the other hand, is used only once for every ten uses of ``rose'' in both Revani and Necati, but the 20-29 uses are still rather high for a single vocabulary item. The combined uses--both words in the same couplet--range from 4 to 6.

If we ask to look at the contexts themselves, we come up with the following screens (I have added the translations and removed some extraneous material:

[REVANI]

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü KÂF:192

Reference List

4. a. Göñli açılmaz yüzi gülmez perişândur şu kim
- b. Bir lebi gonca yüzi gül zülfi sünbül yârı yok

*His heart does not blossom, his face does not bloom (smile), he is in disarray,
Who does not have a beloved with lip like a bud, face like a rose and curl like a hyacinth.*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü NÜN:286

4. a. Bir saçı sünbül yüzi gül gonca-leb dil-dâr ile
- b. Şoñbet-i hâş eylesün bezm-i gül-istân isteyen

He who wants a rose-garden party, let him converse tete-a-tete with a beloved whose hair is a hyacinth, whose face is a rose, whose lip is a bud.

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü HÂ':395

1. a. Düşmiş bu güllerüñ yine kâküller üstine
- b. Kim gördi güllerüñ kona sünbüller üstine

*Curls have again fallen over these roses of yours
Since they saw hyacinths on top of the roses*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü Yâ:442

2. a. Mâh ak gül gice sünbül gül-i nesrin hürşid
b. Vaktidür gel içelüm leyl ü nehâr ey sâki

*The moon is a white rose, the night a hyacinth, the sun a
wild rose
It is time, come let us drink day and night, oh Saki*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü Yâ:474

2. a. Sünbül-i zülfüñi gül-şende benefşe görüben
b. Bükülüp 'ömrüñ uzun yarıcıñ Allâh didi

*Upon seeing the hyacinth of your curl in the rose-garden, the
violet
Bent itself double and said, may your life be long and God be your
intercessor*

[FEVRI]

fevgaz2 LÂM:352

Reference List

1. a. Ne serv egler benüm göñlüm ne gül egler ne hûd sünbül
b. Meger ol kâmeti bâlâ vü ol ruhsâr u ol kâkül

*Neither the cypress pleases my heart, nor does the rose, nor
even the hyacinth
But rather that tall body and that cheek and those locks*

fevgaz2 NÜN:444

4. a. Fenâ-yı bezm-i hüsnuñ tutmayaydı sünbülün ey gül
b. Dü-tâ olmazdı mânend-i benefşe kâmeti gamdan

*Had your hyacinth not been taken by the transitoriness of the
feast of your beauty, oh rose,
It would not have bent its body double like the violet out of grief*

fevgaz2 NÜN:461

1. a. Semen-bû yâsamen-bû serv-kâmet gonca-femsin sen
b. Yüzi gül saçı sünbül bülbul-i bağ-ı Iremsin sen

*It is you who are sweet as jessamine , jasmine-scented, cypress-
bodied, bud-mouthed
It is you who are rose-faced, hyacinth-haired, the nightengale of
the garden of Irem*

fevgaz2 HÂ':610

5. a. Bir beyte yazdı zülfi ile vaşf-ı 'ârızın
b. Fevri gül işledi yine sünbül budağına

*He turned the description of her cheek and her curl into a
couplet
Thus did Fevri embroider a rose on the stem of a hyacinth*

[NECATI]

NECGAZ1 HA':93

Reference List

3. a. Bâg-bân-ı lûtf zülf ü 'ârız ü ruhsârdan
b. Ab üzre gül döşer gül üstine sünbül döşer

*The garden-keeper of benevolence, using curl and cheek and brow
Spreads roses on the water and hyacinths on the roses*

NECGAZ1 HA':243

1. a. Şaçılsun sünbülün cânâ gül üstine nişâb olmaz
b. Kim ol şem'i şeb-ârâdur aña zulmet hicab olmaz

*Scatter your hyacinths as you will, oh my beloved, one can never
veil a rose
For that (rose) is a night-brightening candle and darkness cannot
conceal it*

necgaz2 MIM:358

6. a. Gül ruhlarıñda sünbülün âşüfte göreli
b. Miskîn Necâti 'aqlı dağıtmışdur ey şanem

*When he sees your hyacinth dissheveled on your rose-cheeks
Oh my Idol, miserable Necati's mind is put in disarray*

necgaz2 NUN:418

1. a. Gül yüzünde sünbül-i 'anber-fişânı bilmeyen
b. Oldur ol cennetde 'ömr-i câvidânı bilmeyen

*Who does not know the ambergris-scattering hyacinth on your rose-
cheek
He is one who does not know eternal life in that paradise*

In the context of these examples the senses of ``rose'' and ``hyacinth'' are quite obvious. Nonetheless, the concatenation of examples does more than point to a reading of the line in question. For example, looking at the uses of ``rose/hyacinth'' in all three poets it is possible to begin to see not only what traditional tropes (eg. ``rose/cheek, hyacinth/hair'') exist but how such tropes expand into common motives (eg. the ``hair/hyacinth twisted like the stem of a violet,' ' the ``sweet, pleasant smelling hair/hyacinth'') and thence to

more complex and distant connections (eg. the beloved as gardener who tosses rose petals on the water and strews hyacinths on the roses, the hair/hyacinth as a veil over the face of the rose, the hair/hyacinth as a cover of darkness over the white-rose face of the moon).

Even this very simple use of computer recall brings us a huge step closer to the sensibility of the expert audience, whose knowledge of what a word means is based primarily on remembered uses rather than dictionary definitions. If, however, we follow the process of computer "remembering" a bit deeper, we can both dig deeper into the bases of poetic meaning and locate some tentative criteria for value judgements as well. Consider the second line of our sample poem:

2. a. Hiç aîmayalum hâl ü haţ u zûlfini nâşih
- b. Şol şîve ile hâlet-i ebrûya ne dîrsin

*Oh counselor, let's not mention that mole and cheek-down and curl
But what would you have to say about the state of the eyebrow,
with that (enticing) way of behaving?*

The role of the *nasih* or counselor in this line comes across quite clearly from our store of examples. For instance, the uses elsewhere in Revani are as follows:

4. a. Zûlfînüñ bendine düşmiş yine sevdâ ile dil
- b. Nâşihüñ pendî aña eylememiş her-giz sûd

*Again the heart has fallen through passion into the bonds
of the curl
The advice of the counselor has never done it any good*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü ZÂ':145

3. a. Hâk-i pâ-yî yârdan dil dūr olmaz nâşihâ
- b. 'Aklı başında olan maḥbûba inkâr eylemez

*Oh counselor, the heart can never be far from the earth trod by the
foot of the loved one
He who has his wits about him never denies the beloved*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü ZÂ':152

6. a. Pend-i nâşihla Revânî nice terk olına yâr
- b. Yardan mı atalum göz göre biz kendüzümüz

*Why should Revani abandon the beloved on the advice of the counselor?
Should we throw ourselves off a cliff with our eyes wide open?*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü KÂF:190

4. a. Germiyyet-i meyde bize pend eyleme nâşih
- b. Tâ olmaya bezm ehli arasında şovukluk

*Counselor, do not advise us against the warmth (passion) that wine
induces
So that there not be coldness among the people of the party*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü NÜN:271

5. a. Şöḥbet-i maḥbûb u meyden ḥalkı men' itmezdi hiç
- b. Nâşihun 'aklı Revânî ḳalmasa idrâkden

*He would never keep people from wine and conversing with the beloved
Oh Revani, if the counselor's wits were up to understanding anything*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü NÜN:278

Reference List

5. a. Nâşih Revânî tevbe-şiken olduğu müdâm
- b. Maḥbûbdan mîdur 'acabâ yâ şarâbdan

*Counselor, is Revani's backsliding always because of the beloved or,
I wonder, is it because of wine?*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü NÜN:299

4. a. Göñül gerçekten ol yârı eger sevmezse va'llâhi
- b. Senûñ yanußda ey nâşih benüm sözüm yalan olsun

*If, by God, the heart does not truly love that beloved
Then, oh counselor, you may consider my every word to be untrue*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü NÜN:307

2. a. Menzil-i maḳşûda ırmez pend-i nâşih gûş iden
- b. Yol eri şormaz ṭarîkı zâhid-i güm-râhdan

*He never reaches the milestone of his goal, who listens to the advise
of the counselor
The experienced guide never asks his way from the lost zealot*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü VAV:314

3. a. La'l-i yâra cân virürken baña pendüñ nâşihâ
b. Gûyiyâ şeytân şunar imân içün bîmâra şu

*While I am giving up the ghost for the ruby (lip) of the beloved, your
advice is to me, oh counselor,
Like Satan giving water to the sick for the sake of the faith*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü HA':356

3. a. Yâr ile çokdur 'alâkam nâşihâ ma'zûr tut
b. Ben dañi şöfi olurdum ger 'alâyık olmasa

*My bonds of interest in the beloved are many, oh counselor, excuse me
please,
I too would have been one of the pious, if I had had no interests*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü HA':362

4. a. Rañm iderdüñ sen ne deñlü senç-dilseñ nâşihâ
b. 'Âşıkñ derdine baksañ yârñ istiğnâsına

*No matter what kind of a stony heart you have, you would show
compassion, oh counselor,
Were you to look upon the lover's pain and the indifference of the
beloved*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü HA':368

Reference List

1. a. Uymadı divâne göñlüm hiç nâşih pendine
b. Ol perinüñ şuçı yokdur itdi kendü kendine

*My crazy heart could not conform to the counselor's advice
That fairy has no guilt in this, it did it to itself*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü Yâ:397

4. a. Güzel sevmegi 'âşıkdan yine men' eylemiş nâşih
b. 'Acebdür kendü hâlinde komazlar bir müselmânı

*The counselor prevented the lover from loving a beauty
Its a wonder they ever let a Muslim be a Muslim*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü Yâ:404

3. a. Pend-i nâşih mu'tribâ girmez kulağuma benüm
b. Difiledük çün 'ışk bezminde ma'habbet sâzını

*Oh musician, the advice of the counselor does not enter my ear
For in the banquet of love we listened to the saz of affection*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü Yâ:435

1. a. Pend-i nâşihla kaçan terk idem ol mâh-veşi
b. Kimse balçığ ile her-giz sıvayamaz güneşi

*How could I abandon that moon-faced one on the advice of the
counselor
No one can ever plaster over the face of the sun with mud*

The sense of the uses here is quite clear. Obviously the counselor represents the strictures of traditional religious morality and is an antagonist to the poet/lover who extolls a directly opposed ethos. The case of the *hal* (mole on the beloved's cheek), *hat* (dark down on the cheek), and *zûlf* (curl or lock of hair) is not as clear. They could, and in a sense do, represent the beauty of the beloved. However, in the context of this kind of poetry such a simple relation would run counter to one's expectation. In order to explore the grounding of expectation in this case, let us consider the instances in which 'mole' or 'cheek down' occur in the context of 'lock/curl.' Here the instances have been categorized thematically (a process that, thus far, can only be carried out by human beings).

25

[*hat*=cheek down/script (writing)]

NECGAZ1 Preface:36

Reference List

1. a. Gül yüzünde zülfün örter *hat*-ı reyhanı dürüst
- b. Kim görübdür kâfiri hıfz ide Kur'ânı dürüst

On your rose-face(cheek) your lock covers right up the sweet-smelling down/calligraphic script called 'reyhân'
Such that when he sees it the infidel would memorize the whole Kuran

NECGAZ1 HÂ':101

1. a. *Hat*tuñda kim ol zülf-i perişân yazılubdur
- b. Gûyâ ki gubâr üstine reyhan yazılubdur

When that touseled lock is spread over your cheek-down
It is as if a reyhan (script/sweet smell) were written over dust
(gubar = a tiny script called 'dust script')

NECGAZ1 HÂ':255

Reference List

3. a. Halaş olımadı dil kayd-ı bend-i zülfünden
- b. *Hat*uñdan okıdı biñ kerre sûre-i ihlâş

The heart could not free itself from the bonds of the rope of your lock
(Even though) it read the Sura of Letting Go (Ihlas) from your cheek-down/script

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü RA':59

Reference List

2. a. Nâme bir sîmîn-beden gül yüzlü dil-berdür ki anuñ
- b. Beñleri olmış noķat ĥat zülf-i müşk-efşânıdur

*The letter is a silver-bodied, rose-faced beloved whose
Moles are the dots and whose script is the musky lock*

fevgaz2 YA':644

Reference List

3. a. Kes ĥadıĥ-i zülfüñ âyât-ı ĥatun izhâr kıl
- b. Ehl-i Kır'ânsın behey kâfir gider zünnârufı

*Cut short the hadith of your lock, make visible the verse of your down
You are of the people of the Kuran, you silly infidel, get rid of your
belt*

[Hal, hat, zülf=calamaties, misfortune

NECGAZ1 HA':78

5. a. Bir yaña olmadın ĥam-ı zülfüñ belürdi ĥat
- b. Kanda ise baña her yañadan bir belâ çıkar

*Before my longing for your lock was assuaged (by its
disappearance) your cheek-down appeared
Wherever it may be, from every direction a calamity appears for me*

necgaz2 Preface:398

2. a. Ĥamze vü ĥat u ĥâl ü zülf ü 'izâr
- b. Bre zâlim ne âfet olmışsın

*Wink and down and mole and lock and cheek
Oh tyrant, what a calamity you have been*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü RA':66

1. a. Zülfî dâ'im ĥatı yanında dile kîn eyler
- b. Tolaşur ol aña âĥir beni miskin eyler

*The lock together with the down always wreak vengeance on the heart
The one wanders toward the other and in the end makes me wretched*

RA' UnKnown:52

Reference List

5. a. Esirgerdi ĥam-ı ĥat u hevâ-yı zülfini Fevri
- b. Eger takrîr ideydi yâra kîlk-i ĥun-feşân bir bir

*Fevri, she would deny (you) the sorrow of her down and the passion of
her lock
If the the blood scattering pen were to record them one by one for the
beloved*

Hal=seed, grain

NECGAZ1 HA':82

5. a. Ben gedâ şey-lillâh itdügüm ta'accüb itme kim
- b. Hirmen-i ĥüsnuñde ĥâlün dâne zülfün destedür

*Do not be amazed that I, a beggar, say (give) something for the
sake of God,
In the harvest of beauty your mole is a grain, your lock a sheaf*

#6

Hal, hat zülf=black things, crows, people dressed in black, night

NECGAZ1 HA':105

5. a. Bir yaña oldı hâl ü haṭ ü zülf-i müşg-bâr
b. Cân gülşenini kapladı tıtdı gurâblar

*To one side is the mole and down and musky lock
The rose-garden of the soul has been taken over by crows*

NECGAZ1 HA':162

6. a. Nitekim zulmet çerâğuñ rûşenâsın arturur
b. Rengini ruhsârıñ zülf ile haṭ u hâl açar

*Just as darkness increases the brilliance of the lantern
So do the lock and down and mole enhance the color of the cheek*

NECGAZ1 HA':309

2. a. Ruḥı şevki ile görür haṭtını zülfinde göñül
b. Giceler seyr-i çemen itmege meh-tâb gerek

*Through passion for her cheek the heart sees her cheek-down (behind)
her lock
In order to observe the rose-garden at night there must be moonlight*

necgaz2 Preface:447

3. a. Dil almağa puşuda durur leşkere beñzer
b. Haṭṭ-ı siyehüñ zülf ile ruhsâr arasında

*It resembles soldiers lying in ambush for the heart
The line of dark down between lock and cheek*

Revâni: Gazel Bölümü HA':367

4. a. Zülfüñ şebinde hâlüne mihmân idi göñül
b. Anı ziyâfet eyledi Hân-ı Halil ile

*In the night of your lock the heart is a guest of your mole
With a Feast of Halil the one made a banquet for the other*

Revâni: Gazel Bölümü NÜN:309

Reference List

2. a. Belürmez zülfüñ devrinde haṭṭıñ
b. Görinmez gicede zirâ ki düñ

*When your lock is out your down does not show
Because smoke is not visible at night*

[Şam=darkness, Damascus]

fevgaz2 YA':659

5. a. Haṭṭıña 'azm itdi zülfünden veli irgürmedi
b. Fevriyi Şâma Karamanüñ perişân yolları

*He wanted to go from your lock to your down but
Karaman's tangled roads could not take Fevri to Sham (Damascus)*

Zülf (lock) covers up mole

necgaz2 Preface:366

5. a. Devr-i haddüñde gelüb zülfüñi mahv itdi haţuñ
- b. Ey dirigâ dükenüb 'ömrüm irişdi ecelüm

*In the cycle of your cheek your love-lock came and wiped out your cheek-down
Oh woe is me, my life-span has run out, my final end has been reached*

necgaz2 Preface:492

Reference List

6. a. Dil düzdidürür hâlüñi zülfüñ neye şaklar
- b. Bir uğruyı koltuğına atmağa sebeb ne

*It is a heart-stealer, why does the love-lock conceal the mole?
What reason is there for it to take a thief under its protection?*

Hal, hat, zülf=symbols of evil, infidelity, opposed to religion

necgaz2 Preface:481

1. a. Haţuñ ruh ile zülf-i perişân arasında
- b. Gavga gibidür küfr ile imân arasında

*Your down between cheek and dissheveled lock
Is like a quarrel between unbelief and the true faith*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü ZÂ':155

3. a. Çeşm ü ebrû ile hâl ü haţ u zülfüñ baña bes
- b. Nitekim mü'min olan kişiye beş vaht namâz

*Your eye and eyebrow and mole and down and cheek suffice for me
Just as the five prayers suffice the person who is devout*

Hat=feather-like, zülf=wing-like

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü RÂ':67

1. a. Kaçsa ne 'aceb benden eger yâr perî-vâr
- b. Çün zülf ü haţı gibi anuñ bâl ü peri var

*If my love ^{flies} ~~runs away from me~~ like a fairy, what wonder
For just as she has curl and down so does she have wing and feather*

Çin= China, curl

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü Yâ:398

3. a. Hây zâlim çin-i zülfünden haţuñ leşker çeküp
- b. Gözlerüñ Tatarı yıkdı gönlümüñ Bağdâdını

*Oh tyrant (unjust one), your cheek-down has drawn up soldiers from the
curl/China of your lock
The Tatar of your eyes has destroyed the Baghdad of my heart*

fevgaz2 NÜN:531

6. a. Geldi döküldi Rûm 'izârına haţ u zülf
b. Unutdı misk tâciri Çîn ü Hıtâ yolun

*The down and lock came and spilled onto the cheek of Rum
And the musk merchant forgot the way to China and Cathay*

fevgaz2 LAM:366

4. a. Göz göre haţ üzre düşmiş zülfe nâzır çeşm-i döst
b. Deşt-i Çinde sünbül otlar şan iki miskîn gazâl

*Clearly, the eyes of the beloved looking at the lock fallen
over the down
One would think was two musky gazels grazing on hyacinths in the
desert of China*

Hal + zülf= comet

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü Yâ:425

2. a. Yaza bir kuyruklu yıldız hükmini takvimine
b. Görse zülfiyle muneccim hâl-i müşk-efşânını

*He would record a comet (tailed star) in the chart of her reign
Should the astrologer see her lock and her musk-scattering mole*

Zülf=hyacinth

RA' UnKnown:293

6. a. Bir hûbdur ki kâkül-i pür-tâb-ı yârdan
b. Gülşende takdı başına zülf-i niğâr haţ

*It is a (real) beauty when, in the garden. the down puts zülf-i niğâr
(a kind of hyacinth?) on its head
Made out of the bright curls of the beloved*

Zülf=like chains, rings, loops

RA' UnKnown:295

1. a. Haţuñ itdi göñlümi zülf-i girih-gîr ile zabt
b. Bir esîri kâfir itdi şanki zencîr ile zabt

*Your down has held my heart with the love-lock's ringlets
As though an infidel held a captive in chains*

[Part of face

fevgaz2 NÜN:458

1. a. Üstühân-ı ser tola hâk içre mâr u mûrdan
b. Gitmeye fikr-i haţ u zülfün dil-i mehcûrdan

*Though the bones of the skull lying in the earth may be filled with ants and
worms
Yet let not the thought of down and love-lock go from the foresaken heart*

Hat, zülf=sweet smelling

fevgaz2 NÜN:531

6. a. Geldi döküldi Rûm 'izârına haṭṭ u zülf
 b. Unutdı misk tâciri Çîn ü Hıṭâ yolun

*The down and lock came and spilled onto the cheek of Rum (Turkey)
 And the musk merchant forgot the way to China and Cathay*

In the context of 'the advice of the counselor,' our particular usage of 'mole, cheek-down, love-lock' would seem most likely to belong to the 'calamaties/misfortunes' category. However, the counselor being a representative of a religious perspective, the 'black=evil, irreligious, errant' set of motives are also evoked. If this is true, however, the line is still quite simple when we compare it to many of the above citations. The more complex line rests on a special meaning and/or, in many cases, on a double meaning for one or several lexical items. An obvious example is the case of *hat* (cheek-down) which also means '(Arabic) script' and the particular script called *reyhân/reyhâni* which also means 'fragrant.' Thus the perfumed down on the beloved's cheek is related--in the world of language--to a calligraphic script that was commonly used for representing the words of the Quran.

A less obvious example might be the last citation:

6. a. Geldi döküldi Rûm 'izârına haṭṭ u zülf
 b. Unutdı misk tâciri Çîn ü Hıṭâ yolun

*The down and lock came and spilled onto the cheek of Rum
 And the musk merchant forgot the way to China and Cathay*

This couplet's imagery belongs to a group which uses the double sense of the word *çin* ('China, North China/curl, fold, pleat') to associate the smell of the love-lock to the perfume of the musk-gland

of the Chinese musk-deer. The ways in which this is worked out in the tradition is exemplified by the following citations:



Revânî: Gazel Bölümü RA':124

4. a. Benefşe büy.i zülfüñle cihânı müşk-bâr itdi
- b. Meger kim Çin ü Mâçinden gelür bir Hindi tâcirdür

*The violet has made the earth musk-scented with the smell of your locks
As though it is an Indian merchant come from North and South China*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü KAF:192

3. a. Hâce-i Çinüñ metâ'in almazam bir hâbbeye
- b. Kim anuñ hâlüñ gibi bir nâfe-i tatarı yok

*I wouldn't give a grain for the goods of a Chinese wiseman
For there is no Tatar musk-bag like her mole*

Revânî: Gazel Bölümü Yâ:454

4. a. Nâfe-i zülfüñ öger müşki koyup bâd-ı şabâ
- b. Çin ü Mâçine varup gezdi Hıta vü Hoteni

*The East Wind praises the scent-bag of your locks and forgets about musk
(Even though) it has gone and traveled all of Cathay and Khotan*

NECGAZ1 Preface:38

1. a. Oldı burka' zülf-i müşgîn el-ğiyâş
- b. Gâlib oldı kâfir-i Çin el-ğiyâş

*The musky love-lock has become a veil, God help me!
The infidel of China has become victorious, God help me!*

NECGAZ1 HA':270

1. a. Şabâ gibi ser-i zülfüñi kim ider ta'rif
- b. Hemîşe nâfe-i çini nesim ider ta'rif

*Just as the East Wind describes your locks
So does the breeze ever describe the musk-bag of China*

NECGAZ1 HA':278

Reference List

6. a. Büy.i zülfüñi şabâdan işidüb nâfe-i Çin
- b. Didi ben Ruma varub neyleyeyüm bû olıcak

*When the musk-bag of China heard of your locks from the East Wind
It said, while this (scent) exists why should I travel to Rum*

necgaz2 Preface:475

3. a. Virdük ayağı toprağına nâfe-i Çini
- b. Ey bâd-ı şabâ var yirü hayr eyle toydınca

*We have sacrificed the musk-bag of China for the earth on which she steps
Oh East Wind go and welcome to it until you have had enough*

2. a. Mey diyu eger devr elinden yudasın kan
b. Gül gibi gül ey nâfe-i Çin yüzüñi dürme

*If you are going to drink blood from the hand of fate and
call it wine
Oh musk-bag of China, smile like a rose and do not put on a sour
face*

5. a. Şabâ ki müşğ-fişân oldu saçı çininden
b. Hâtâ ider şu ki vara Hıtâyâ çine ile

*When the East Wind scatters musk from the curl/China of her hair,
He has made a mistake who goes to Cathay with grain to trade (for
musk)*

In the line from Fevri, as in the last line of the citation list (Necati, 547), there is an additional reference to the graphic similarity (a false-derivation) between *hat*=''down'' (written *h̄t̄*) and *Hıtâ*=Cathay (written *h̄t̄â*) which is compounded by Necati to include the word *hatâ*=''mistake, error'' (also written *h̄t̄â*). It is also clear that the musk-gland is dark black when prepared for transport and sale which associates with the darkness of the mole, cheek-down, and hair. If we follow our trail of associations--China=curl=source of musk, cheek-down=Cathay=source of musk--we come to Rum, from the word for ''Roman'' which was used to mean both the lands of the Ottomans (as descendents of the Byzantines (Romans to the Muslims) and the European (also ''Roman'') part of the Ottoman Empire.

If we look at uses of the word ''Rum'' in Necati, for example, it becomes clear in what sense it is commonly used.

Aq

4. a. Ruḥlaruñda ḥâl-i 'anber-bâruñı gören didi
b. Rûma iklim-i Habeş sultânıdur düşmiş garîb

*Who sees your ambergris-laden mole on your cheeks would say
The Sultan of the lands of Abyssinia has come a stranger to Rum
(Europe/Byzantium)*

NECGAZ1 Preface:30

4. a. Rumdur bu Rumda 'ömr.i dirâz olmaz dimeñ
- b. Uzasun koñ ruḥlarında zülf.i müşg-efşân.ı döst

*This is Rum and do not say that in Rum a long life is impossible
So that it be long place on its cheeks the the musk-scattering
locks of the beloved*

NECGAZ1 Preface:40

4. a. Ruḥlarıñda zülfüñ ucından neler çekdüm didüm
- b. Didi bes gavḡâlu olur Rûmda elbette uc

*I said, Oh what I have suffered from (seeing) the tip (uc) of your
locks on your cheeks
And she said, well enough, of course the frontier (uc) in Rum is troublesome*

NECGAZ1 HÂ':52

Reference List

5. a. Rum illerinde gibi hem alur hem öldürür
- b. Yollar başıcı kâkül.i güm-râhdan meded

*Just as in Rum it takes people and kills them,
Save me from this brigand, this wayward lock*

NECGAZ1 HÂ':59

5. a. Ey gönül Rum ile Şâma ta'n iden dilberlerüñ
- b. 'Ariz.ı simin ile zülf.i siyâhı yok mıdur

*Oh heart, don't these beloveds who criticise both Rum and Syria
Have both a silvery cheek and black locks?*

NECGAZ1 HÂ':77

4. a. Zülf ü ruḥuñda baḡlu göñüller dizin dizin
- b. Rûm illerinde nite ki zencir ile esir

*The hearts bound to your cheek and locks in rows
Are like chained prisoners in the lands of Rum*

NECGAZ1 HÂ':110

1. a. Didüm ol yüzde neden ḥâl.i mu'anber çoḡ olur
- b. Didi bu Rûm ilidür bunda güzeller çoḡ olur

*I asked, why are the ambergris-scented moles many on that face
She said, this is the land Rum and the beauties are many there*

NECGAZ1 HÂ':202

4. a. Şan ki Rum ili ḥarâmîsidürür ḥâl.i ruḥuñ
- b. Ki öldürür cân kâr-bânın varını andan alur

*One might suppose that the mole on your cheek is one of the brigands of
Rum
Who murders the caravan of the soul and takes its goods from it*

NECGAZ1 HA':221

4. a. Bilâd-ı Çine senüñ gibi bir şanem heyhât
b. Diyâr-ı Rûma saçüñ gibi bir şalib olmaz

*For the Lands of China alas there is no idol like you
For the Lands of Rum there is no cross like your hair*

necgaz2 Preface:360

1. a. Şâmiler itmesün diyü ikide bir hüçûm
b. Götürdi zülf kâ'idesin yüzden ehl-i Rûm

*In order that the Syrians not attack at every moment
The people of Rum have carried the bonds of the love-lock away from the face*

necgaz2 Preface:566

1. a. Ey hâl-i ruhuñ memleket-i Rûm harâcı
b. Câ'iz ki saçüñ misk-i Hütenden ala bacı

*Oh the mole of your face is the tax taken by the Country of Rum
(Therefore) it is right that your hair take a toll from the musk of Cathay*

necgaz2 Preface:640

3. a. Çin ü Hutenüñ bacını boynufa mı alduñ
b. Ey hâl-i ruhi memleket-i Rûm harâcı

*Have you taken the toll of North and South China on your neck
Lo, the mole of her cheek is the tax of the Land of Rum*

necgaz2 Preface:597

Reference List

1. a. Didüm hüsnüñ berâtında nedür zülf-i siyâh egri
b. Didi bu Rumdur derviş olur tevki'.i şâh egri

*I said, what are these twisted locks (doing) on the letters patent of your beauty
She said, Oh dervish, this is Rum and the signature of the monarch is twisted*

necgaz2 Preface:609

4. a. Ruhsârına bak zülf-i siyeh-gârını añma
b. Ey dil şefekat Rumdadur Şâmı ko şimdi

*Look at her cheek and do not mention her evil-doing locks
Oh heart, loving mercy is in Rum so forget (black) Syria now*

necgaz2 Preface:616

3. a. Ruğların devrinde Rum üstine leşkerler çeküb
b. Zülf-i pürçinüñ zırılırlar geydi şâmiler gibi

*During the reign of your cheeks, your locks full of ringlets
Drew up soldiers against Rum and put on chain-mail like Syrians*

NECGAZ1 Preface:22

Reference List

2. a. Zülfüñ dünini gün yüzüñe şalma rahm kıl
b. Gam-gın olur garib göñül çünki şâm ola

*Don't cast the dark of the lock into the face of the sun, have mercy
The stranger-heart will be grief-stricken because it will be night*

NECGAZ1 HA':48

3. a. Meskenet toprağına her subh u şâm
b. Döşenübdür secde-gâhumdur nemed

*Each morning and evening on the earth of poverty
I spread (black) felt as my place of prayer*

NECGAZ1 HA':121

3. a. Zülfüñe nisbet yâ alnuñ ola cennet yâ ruñuñ
b. Çünki Şamuñ bâğ-ı huld altında yâ üstindedür

*With reference to your locks, is your brow to be heaven or your cheek?
For is the Garden of Eternity beneath Damascus/Syria or above it?*

NECGAZ1 HA':160

3. a. Mâni' olma ko şalinsun cân ile dil zülfüñe
b. Ol sevâd-ı Şâmdur bir iki şeydâdan n'olur

*Forget it, don't stand in the way, let the heart and soul go to
the love-locks,
It is urban Damascus, what can happen (to it) because of one or
two impassioned ones?*

necgaz2 Preface:472

Reference List

3. a. Şâm-ı zülfüñle göñül Mısrı harâb oldı diyu
b. Saña iletđi kebûter haberi döne döne

*In order to say that the (black) Syria of your locks has destroyed the
Egypt of the heart
The pigeon post brought the news to you circling and circling*

necgaz2 Preface:495

1. a. Zineti artar cemâlüñ zülf-i 'anber-fâm ile
b. Mısr Yüsuf tahtı iken buldı revnak Şâm ile

*Your beauty's adornment is increased by the ambergris-scented lock
While Egypt was the throne of Joseph, it found glory by way of
(black) Syria*

necgaz2 Preface:620

6. a. Şâm-ı zülfüñ haqqı ma'mûr oldı ey Yusuf-cemâl
b. Olalı dil mısrı sultân-ı hayâlüñ meskeni

*The rights of the (black) Syria of your locks are looked after, Oh Joseph-
like beauty,
So long as the Egypt of the heart is the dwelling of the Monarch of
Imagination*

The association of *Rum* here is with idea that the people of Europe and Byzantium are fair-skinned and, therefore, the fair cheek and the Land of *Rum* become bound together. The *Rum*=fair association is made explicit by appearing in contrast to *Sam*, *şam* a word which means ``Syria, Damascus'' and also ``night, darkness.'' Thus the world of the beloved's face is divided into countries, each of which have associations to particular facial features.

An interesting point of subtle discrimination revealed by simply examining lists of references occurs when we look in more detail at the above list. In Necati (before 1509 c.e.) *Rum* seems to refer only to Europe and the European provinces and not to the central Ottoman lands as in both Revani and Fevri, who are writing in the middle and second half of the 16th century. Moreover, ^{in Necati} there is a constant reference to the dangerousness of *Rum*, its battles, and ruthless robbers. In our pool of texts this is unique to Necati and may, on further examination, be attributable to either period or personality.

Returning to the line from our sample poem from which this series of associative digressions began, we can also see that this particular use of ``mole'' and ``cheek-down'' and ``love-lock'' as special beauties of the beloved's face that cause trouble for the lover and are advised against--because of their evil/black character--by the counselor is comparatively barren of associations. Our knowledge of possible associations built up through the capacity of the computer to list exhaustive lists of references quickly and easily not only enables us to read more fully but allows us to make the kind of judgments about the relative value of lines of poetry that one might expect from an expert within the tradition.

In an time when old age, accident, and a shrinking pool of scholars

presages the inevitable end of a personal chain of sensibility leading back into Ottoman times, we must be alert to every opportunity to discover ways in which we can keep alive and restore the foundations of our ability to read, understand, and appreciate the Ottoman poetic tradition. As I have tried to indicate, even very uncomplicated uses of the computer can amplify our abilities as readers to the point at which one can see the ^{partial} reconstruction of the sensibility informing Ottoman poetry as an achievable goal.

In a broader sense, such a reconstruction would also enable us to gain a better perspective on what it is for us to read, to know, and to experience the rightness of a reading or knowing. It is this understanding of ourselves that is the goal of the humanities even when we employ decidedly ^{now} ~~non~~human devices in its pursuit.