

## Addendum on neurosciences

- the ability to image the working of a living brain - test our assumptions about what we feel and what we believe about what we feel.

Kitayama  
Paine  
- emotional responses (such as "love"/  
"LFA") are not hard-wired. They  
are learned from our cultures. [Values are  
acquired (cultural tasks, etc.)  
mediated responses] [historical,  
continuous-traces]

- we all, everywhere, live among aliens.  
[if we think that there is something  
called love that we share with everyone  
else - we are wrong]

chronic accessibility of psychological  
emotional responses.

# Love is a Many-Splendored Garden:

from Ottoman Turkish Love to Cultural Neuroscience

1

It seems intuitively true that there exists a thing we call “love”, something that is quintessentially human, something we share with everyone else on the planet...[or something we share with every sane

2

person, at least]. Nonetheless, it doesn't take us long to learn that there are many, many flavors even of what we might call “romantic love”—at one extreme, a tingling in the loins, an instant attraction, an attractive face on the bus, a glance...like the 13<sup>th</sup> century troubadour's *fin'amors* as in this:

*That day, my lady, when I first discovered*

*That you exist, that time you first allowed*

*Me to behold you, the thought of any other*

*Left my heart, my longings found an abode*

*In you. Thus, lady, you gave me to know*

*Longing, with a sweet smile, a simple glance:*

*You made me forget myself and all existence.*

illustrate what I say with some images of art and other things, but not in the way an art historian would either. The poem begins, formally with a rhyming couplet, and, as so much love does, with a glance:

③

19. *Oh silver-body, your glance tears the soul to shreds*

*That you might weave a heart-thief's shirt of soul-threads*

In the Ottoman view, the soul (can) is the vital principle, the principle of life that runs like a thread—or like the wick of a candle—through the physical body—the “wax” of the candle, which the flame of love will burn away. It is represented in traditional physiology by the “ruler vein” (the “shah” vein) that diagrammatically runs through the center of the body with all other blood vessels branching from it. But this soul thread is also an extension of the spiritual world of undifferentiated being, the ultimate source of all life...the divine. What the silver-bodied beloved's glance does is to enter (through the eyes) and take possession of the lover's soul-thread, as it has done with the soul-threads of ever so many other lovers,

6

22. *What secrets do the beloved's face and lip and teeth reveal?*

*A mote in the sun and, in that mote, the Pleiades*

The beautiful mouth is always small, the face, when it is not a moon, is the sun, and the teeth gleam in that tiny mouth like the Seven Sisters of the Pleiades.

7

23. *Are those freckles I see there in the dimple of your chin*

*Or are they seeds in an apple, o you of the slim body*

24. *The arrow-wounds of your glances made a sieve of my breast,*

*That I might ever pass through your neighborhood as a sifter of dust\**

In early-modern Western and Middle Eastern love theory, the heart is the “seat of love” and love is “caught”—like an infectious disease—when a vision of the beloved or the beloved’s glance enters through the eyes and pierces the heart. Alternatively, a glance can pierce the breast like an

(9)

26. *If I go into the garden without you, pain and woe mount in my heart*

*Paradise without the rose-bed is Jacob's Tent of Sorrow to the  
nightengale*

The role of the garden in the Perso-Ottoman poetic tradition is worth a whole lecture series itself. Suffice it to say that the garden is where love happens, where every feature—plant, animal, topography—becomes a metaphor for some aspect of the story of love. The cypress is the beloved's body embraced by the flowering tree of the lover's burgeoning passion. It is the place where relaxation, comfort, and joy abide. But for the lover [nightengale], when the beloved—him or herself a bed of roses—is absent, even Paradise, the garden of gardens, is the site of sadness, loneliness, and loss—loss here evoked by the foundational Quranic (and Biblical) tale of Joseph and the tent of a bereaved Jacob grieving the reported death of his dearly beloved son.

(click click)

27. *Your hair brought the tribute of China to the Shah's threshold:*

*In many loads of the sweet-smelling musk of Khotan*

myself and all existence". Her loveliness, the slim silver-white body, rosy cheeks, dimpled chin, the raven locks...draw him into her orbit, where he is buffeted by her moods, entranced by her, pierced through and through by her glances, desperate without her, drowned in the precious musky fragrance of her dark locks...

But what if this isn't really as familiar as it seems? What if we go right down to the bottom and what we find is truly alien?

Ca'fer's beautiful little love poem is an excellent example of the Ottoman "gazel"—a wildly popular genre of short, more or less sonnet-length romantic, erotic love-lyrics, of which the Ottoman poets composed thousands upon thousands for centuries.

But consider this... this gazel appears in the context of a song sung by a nightingale, embedded centrally in a 57 couplet "kaside" or panegyric ode on spring, praising Sultan Bayezit II (who reigned from 1481-1512). The gazel's final couplet—couplet 27—and by extension the whole embedded nightingale gazel, serves as a formal transition from a lyric prelude on spring in the garden to outright praise of the sultan begun in


( Osman) with the third of the caliphs (Osman, known significantly as The Generous).

Love for the monarch or patron is nothing new to us in the West.

Heart-felt devotion to the mighty was intense and deeply felt when monarchs were monarchs and subjects were truly subject to their whims.

But, what we might call “romantic love” or “erotic love” is seldom, if ever, overtly evoked in regard to rulers or most patrons. Here, in the embedded “romantic love lyric” of Ca’fer’s poetic eulogy, there is no question that this “beloved” is the young, slim, fatally attractive, androgynous boy-girl of Ottoman erotic verse. This is, in fact, a beloved that has no physical or

societal relation to the actual Sultan.

 Precisely the same kind of erotic relationship is seen in this miniature illustration from an Ottoman manuscript. It shows the Sultan (Sultan Suleyman the Magnificent [r. 1520-1566]) being handed a nosegay of flowers by what the Ottomans would have considered a “very sexy” youth.

But the accompanying text tells a quite different story .

Later, while serving as Endowment Administrator of the School of Hadith, he compiled a Biography of Poets and made a present of it to the

( emotionless display of talent or an expression of mystical devotion to the divine. It could not be truly erotic or sexual. It must be something else: an inability to appreciate real love, emotional insincerity, or mysticism... a view that flies in the face of copious evidence, I should add.

Once I stopped butting my head against the received tradition and started looking away from “love as sexual desire”, the “something else” appeared show up rather vividly. Supported by a digital analysis of a large corpus of Ottoman love lyrics, I came to the tentative conclusion that this poetry was, in a fundamental sense, about personal connection, about the emotional aura surrounding *bonding and separation*.

Separation (and to a lesser extent, bonding) is referenced in Ottoman poetry, in many ways. It is couched in a rich vocabulary of synonyms or near synonyms. And it has a central theme of intense suffering summed up with unusual directness in the following gazel by Baki, perhaps the sixteenth century’s most famed Ottoman poet: |

( 12



The history of emotions is a relatively new field and an exciting departure from the usual discipline-bound practices of academia. It brings together scholars from diverse fields, such as medicine, psychology, neuroscience, art, architecture, literature, music, history, sociology, and anthropology in what, for me, have been stimulating explorations of how emotion—what we feel—is generated, how it is differentiated and theorized, how it changes over time, and how it impacts the ways in which we organize our lives and understand our world.

13 Entitled *The Making of Romantic Love*, Reddy's book is centered about the origins of the 12<sup>th</sup> century European troubadour tradition of *fin'amors* or "courtly love". Troubadour courtly love, as Reddy analyzes it, is intrinsically interesting, because it reveals the origins of a way of thinking that persists today in our own, firmly naturalized understanding of romantic love. And knowing ourselves, I believe, comes before knowing others.

With apologies to Professor Reddy and to those upon whose fields I am trespassing with only borrowed expertise, I am going to extract from Reddy's arguments, a few points that I believe are helpful in thinking and talking productively about the emotional content of romantic love.

The consequences of these notions were many, most of them intended to control the behaviors of the secular aristocracy and some of them are quite recognizably in play even today.

- Clergy at all levels, who hitherto had often married and had families, were now required to be celibate and unpolluted by sexual activity and desire in order to administer the rites and sacraments of the church effectively.
- Sexual behavior—although always polluting to some degree—was permissible only within marriage and for the purpose of procreation.
- Marriage was permanent and theoretically indissoluble.
- The only truly non-sinful life was a monastic, celibate, and abstinent life. Consequently, during the 11<sup>th</sup> and 12 centuries, abbeys, convents, and monasteries burgeoned.

According to Reddy, the *fin'amors*, the courtly love of the troubadours (and female trobaritz) was an emotional reaction to and rejection of the notion that the complexities of love could be reduced to a sinful and self-absorbed appetite. This was a reaction and rejection which had clear political consequences, which I will pass over for now. It accepted the

influenced powerfully by mystical religion [Sufism]—lust is a physiological metaphor, a material bridge that leads one toward “real” love, which is spiritual longing for union with (or re-attachment to) the Divine. The early modern Ottoman poet would agree with the Renaissance Italian, Michaelangelo Buonarrotti on the spiritual value of actual sexual desire.

(John Frederick Nims)

*Not true that it's always grim with mortal sin*

*this love for a ravishing beauty here on earth,*

*as long as it melts the hard heart, shows its worth*

*as a target for divine love's arrowhead...*

Except that Ottoman Islam does not necessarily see sex and sexual desires as mortal sin—this is the Christian legacy of the Gregorian Reformation. ~~For the troubadour, sexual feelings unrestrained are a source~~

~~of guilt.~~ (Bernart de Ventadorn b. ca 1120)

*I fear and cherish her so well*

*And passionately love her so,*

*Yet of this love I dare not tell*

*Nor ask the gifts she might bestow*

*begin here  
from 18*

Ottoman

The beloved takes pleasure from the torment caused by the lover's uncontrollable desire. In this, the beloved is an agent of the divine, arousing an intoxication, a fire of unfulfilled desire that drives the lover to cross the abyss that separates the particular loves of this world from the divine source of all love. It is the painful separation, the longing that is primary. ...for an 18<sup>th</sup> c. Ottoman mystical poet "love"—in the gathering of love—in the garden of love—is like this:

19

*The rose a flame*

*Rosebush a flame*

*Garden a flame*

*Stream a flame*

*For lovers made of salamander-stuff*

*The tulip-bed aflame should be enough.*

*Even now, oh Saki,*

*Ignite a cup with flames of wine*

*For the hand of one who holds my heart;*

*Who came enraged to the party*

*And flames here still*

*Like the candle of the gathering*

But continuing with Reddy's argument. His subtitle is *Longing and Sexuality in Europe, South Asia, and Japan, 900-1200 CE*. By introducing a comparative context, he highlights some of the contradictions that plague our notion of romantic love. He also provides evidence for a theory of "love" as multiple representations of a fundamental emotion which he calls "longing for association", which is similar to what I have called "desire for bonding" in an Ottoman context. In the rest of my talk I want to explore some broad outlines of why thinking in terms of the more general, fundamental term can be instructive.

21

Reddy begins his comparison with 11<sup>th</sup> and 12 century Bengal and Orissa and a context where sexual desire is neither a polluting appetite to be sublimated through self-denial or a bridge to union with the divine, a bridge to be crossed through suffering. Reddy's comparison centers about

22

the religious practices of Puranic Hinduism identified with the Purushottama temple (now known as the Jagannath temple) in Puri and an epic poem, the *Gita Govinda* by the 12<sup>th</sup> century poet-saint Jayadeva. My time this



A girl with curving hips. Bending  
to whisper in his ear,  
Cherishes her kiss on her lover's  
tingling cheek

Eager for the art of his love on the Jumna riverbank, a girl  
Pulls his silk cloth toward a thicket  
of reeds with her hand

[From the Barbara Stoler Miller translation]

Jayadeva's tale focuses on the love affair between a youthful Krishna-as-Govinda and a Gopi girl, Radha, who is immortalized as his consort. In an abbreviated version, the plot line of the story is: god-meets-gopi, they become lovers, god and gopi are separated by her jealousy of his sexual play with the other gopis, god and gopi are reunited and have great sex. Here, the suffering of separation and the joy of union are not abstract representations of a journey to a transcendent state. The god and his

practiced. Erotic pleasure is to be enjoyed in the proper refined, god-like mood—a mood evoked only by practicing the “science or art of KAMA” (the art of sexual pleasure). There exists no gap between the “fleshy” and the “spiritual” (or between sinful lust and *fin’amors*, or between metaphoric love and *real*/love).

A non-exclusive, non-dualistic distinction exists between the worldly realm of emotions surrounding sexual desire (*bhava*) and a universal realm of refined emotions (*rasa*). *Bhava* is enacted in longing (called *rati*) for a particular this-worldly beloved. *Rati* is converted into *rasa* in a refined sentiment called *shringara rasa*, or desiring romantic association with “a heroic, sublime, godlike, or divine sexual partner”. There is no fundamental distinction between sexual desire and “love”. [...] 226

28

In Japan during the Heian period (794-1185 CE), the conception of sexual or romantic desire differed from both the Western and Orissan concepts. It conformed broadly to a blend of Buddhism and Japanese indigenous worship of local spirits called *kami*. Sexual desire and sexual partnerships were entirely worldly and like all worldly desires or

Sexual associations are indistinguishable from patronage or business associations, for example. Moreover, sexual desire is no more or less special, or sinful, or godlike or productive of suffering than desire for status, or promotion, or acclaim as a poet.

In Murasaki Shikibu's "Tale of Genji", the beautiful prince, "shining Genji", in his youth, has all the qualities of an ideal lover: good looks, the right hair-do, elegant clothes, a talent for poetry and refined conversation, social position, and so on. Genji represents the dream of a "splendid partner" in mutual longing for a compassionate collaboration that grants a fleeting sense of the fulfillment actually accessible only to the truly enlightened. He passes from romantic attachment to romantic attachment in a formalized cascade of

- enticing glimpses, elegantly coy glances,
- spying on beautiful women,
- communication by melancholy verses (waka) dashed off in the throes of passion and delivered by intermediaries,



Uncomplicated sexual liaisons without deep attachment were readily available to the elites of both realms. They did not need to invest in emotional partnerships in order to have sex, as one scholar put it, “one <sup>Need to</sup> does not buy a farm because one is hungry”. The relations of medieval European aristocrats, which included marriages, divorces, adulteries, abductions, and rapes were not so much about sex as about political alignments and control. Ottoman male elites often had multiple wives and concubines. The objects of Ottoman poetry and art’s sexualized desire were most commonly youthful males for whom desire could be easily spiritualized or linked to the kind of self-sacrificial devotion, loyalty, and service expected by potential patrons. In the Ottoman context, all relationships, all attachments seem to be imagined in terms of what we would identify as romantic love. I believe that if you really want to understand the Ottoman Empire at its most powerful, it is best to forget the fierce warriors and unstoppable armies and think of it as an empire of love.

In my title, I indicated that I would say something about love and cultural neuroscience.

As far as what “love” really means to us, on the one hand, we are—  
from place to place, from culture to culture—profoundly alien to one  
another. And yet...on the other hand, we all seem to share a need, a  
longing, to bond to one another, to create partnerships or associations that  
enhance our lives, give us comfort, make us secure, and bind us to those  
around us.

When I describe love as a many-splendored garden, it is because the  
unique blossoms of love are as many and varied and wonderful as the  
social and cultural environments that produce them.

Consider, as a final example, another poem by Baki in which the  
longing for a romantic attachment and longing for attachment to a powerful  
ruler are held, strangely yet touchingly, in delicate balance...

34

Through the pathway of my eyes comes the brilliance of the beloved's spirit  
Into the house of the soul come the light-scattering rays of the sun of love

Bonding with the beloved is that which I would buy with my life  
If it cost a thousand soul-coins for a moment, it would come cheaply

For the lovers who are garden keepers of the rose bower of love for you  
The burn scar is the rose, the blue smoke hyacinth and sweet basil

like the flower-bud.  
The breast of the earth is cloven  
by the torrent of my tears.  
Each morning  
my sigh makes heaven's wheel  
set flames upon its head.  
All through the wilds  
the poppy weeps blood,  
Cries out, until its eye is red  
and its pupil  
is a charred scar of love.  
When the eternal architect  
built that dwelling,  
my heart,  
He made open wounds for windows,  
and arrows of grief  
into pillars here and there.  
Truly, in this world,  
fairy-faced angels  
are many, and yet,  
When you are gone  
my eye perceives no angel,  
no fairy.  
If the sword of fate  
split me head from body  
as dot from letter,  
Then your love-script  
can never die  
from the tablet of my heart.  
If Āhī offer himself  
to your life-giving sword,  
is it any wonder?  
He gives his life  
that his burning heart  
be quenched in a bright, flowing stream..

During a conversation with the late Sultan Selim he even said, "I am a denier [of the existence] of [real/true] love. What they call "love" is pure fairy-tale and for an intelligent person to claim [the existence of true] love is ignorance." The late Monarch replied, "On my oath, your denial of love and lack of any idea about it is obvious from your poetry for in your poetry the flavor of [true] love is entirely absent."

This is especially a trace of the [inborn quality] of loving women. As a result of that curse, his poetry is devoid of sweetness and his words of burning anguish. The late Tacizāde, with such power of thought and abundance of natural talent, was still unaware and even perhaps neglectful of some subjects.

---

Love is a Many-Splendored Garden:

from Ottoman Turkish Love to Cultural Neuroscience

It seems intuitively true that there exists a thing we call “love”, something that is quintessentially human, something that we share with everyone else on the planet...[or that we share with every sane person, at least]. Nonetheless, it doesn't take us long to learn that there are many, many flavors even of what we might call “romantic love”—at one extreme a tingling in the loins, an instant attraction, an attractive face on the bus, a glance...like the 13<sup>th</sup> century troubadour's *fin'amors* as in this:

*That day, my lady, when I first discovered*

*That you exist, that time you first allowed*

*Me to behold you, the thought of any other*

*Left my heart, my longings found an abode*

*In you. Thus, lady, you gave me to know*

*Longing, with a sweet smile, a simple glance:*

*You made me forget myself and all existence.*

illustrate what I say with some images of art and other things, but not in the way an art historian would either. The poem begins, formally with a rhyming couplet, and, as so much love does, with a glance:

19. *Oh silver-body, your glance tears the soul to shreds*

*That you might weave a heart-thief's shirt of soul-threads*

In the early Ottoman view, the soul (can) is the vital principle, the principle of life that runs like a thread—or like the wick of a candle—through the physical body—the “wax” of the candle. It is represented in traditional physiology by the “ruler vein” (the “shah” vein) that diagrammatically runs through the center of the body with all other blood vessels branching from it. But this soul thread is also an extension of the spiritual world of undifferentiated being, the ultimate source of all life...the divine. What the silver-bodied beloved’s glance does is to enter (through the eyes) and take possession of the lover’s soul-thread, as it has done with the soul-threads of ever so many other lovers, weaving them into a shirt...a shirt that cloaks

it rules the transmutation of initial bad luck to ultimate good luck. This beloved may be angry now but things will soon change for the better.

22. *What secrets do the beloved's face and lip and teeth reveal?*

*A mote in the sun and, in that mote, the Pleiades*

The beautiful mouth is always small, the face, when it is not a moon, is the sun, and the teeth gleam in that tiny mouth like the Seven Sisters of the Pleiades.

23. *Are those freckles I see there in the dimple of your chin*

*Or are they seeds in an apple, o you of the slim body*

24. *The arrow-wounds of your glances made a sieve of my breast,*

*That I might ever pass through your neighborhood as a sifter of dust\**

In early-modern Western and Middle Eastern love theory, the heart is the “seat of love” and love is “caught”—like an infectious disease—when a vision of the beloved or the beloved’s glance enters through the eyes and

26. *If I go into the garden without you, pain and woe mount in my heart*

*Paradise without the rose-bed is Jacob's Tent of Sorrow to the  
nightengale*

The role of the garden in the Perso-Ottoman poetic tradition is worth a whole lecture series itself. Suffice it to say that the garden is where love happens, where every feature—plant, animal, topography—is a metaphor for some aspect of the story of love. It is the place where relaxation, comfort, and joy abide. But for the lover <sup>the</sup> [nightengale], when the beloved—him or herself a bed of roses—is absent, even Paradise, the garden of gardens, is the site of sadness, loneliness, and loss, here evoked by the foundational Quranic (and Biblical) tale of Joseph and the tent of a bereaved Jacob grieving for the loss of his dearly beloved son.

27. *Your hair brought the tribute of China to the Shah's threshold:*

*In many loads of the sweet-smelling musk of Khotan*



cheeks, dimpled chin, the raven locks...draw him into her orbit, where he is buffeted by her moods, entranced by her, pierced through and through by her glances, desperate without her, drowned in the precious musky fragrance of her dark locks...

But what if this isn't really as familiar as it seems? What if we go right down to the bottom and what we find there is nothing but difference?

Ca'fer's beautiful little love poem is an excellent example of the Ottoman "gazel"—a wildly popular genre of short, more or less sonnet-length romantic, erotic love-lyrics, of which the Ottoman poets composed thousands upon thousands for centuries.

But consider: this gazel appears in the context of a song sung by a nightingale, embedded centrally in a 57 couplet "kaside" or panegyric ode on spring in praise of the Sultan Bayezit II. ~~The gazel's final couplet—couplet 27—and by extension~~ <sup>T</sup> the whole embedded nightingale gazel, serves as a formal transition from a lyric prelude on spring in the garden to outright praise of the sultan begun in lines 28 and 29 and continuing for 28 more lines. At the transition, the metaphoric shah of the love poem will materialize as the present ruler:

monarchs and subjects were truly subject to their whims. But, what we might call “romantic love” or “erotic love” is seldom, if ever, overtly evoked in regard to rulers or most patrons. Here, ~~in~~ the embedded “romantic love lyric” of Ca’fer’s poetic eulogy, <sup>/LOVES N: ~~there is no~~ Doubt</sup> there is no question that this “beloved” is the young, slim, fatally attractive, androgynous boy-girl of Ottoman erotic verse. This is a beloved that has no physical or societal relation to the actual Sultan.

Precisely the same kind of erotic relationship seen in the following miniature illustration from an Ottoman manuscript. It shows the Sultan (Sultan Suleyman the Magnificent [dates?]) being handed a nosegay of flowers by what the Ottomans would have considered a “very sexy” youth. But the accompanying text tells a <sup>suite</sup> ~~very~~ different story [click].

Later, while serving as Endowment Administrator of the School of Hadith, he compiled a Biography of Poets and made a present of it to the Sultan, catching his ear with pleading for an appointment as Inscraper of the Signature or Finance Minister.”

[Aşık Çelebi, Meşa'iru's-Şu'era: Sehī entry.]

obtuseness of

Once I stopped butting my head against the received tradition and started looking away from “love as sexual desire”, the “something else” showed up rather quickly. Supported by a digital analysis of a large corpus of Ottoman love lyrics, I came to the conclusion that this poetry was about personal connection, about the emotional aura surrounding *bonding and separation*. Separation <sup>(and the desire for bonding)</sup> ~~(and to a lesser extent, bonding)~~ <sup>are</sup> is referenced in Ottoman poetry, in many ways. <sup>Separation</sup> It is couched in a rich vocabulary of synonyms or near synonyms. ~~And~~ It has a central theme of intense suffering summed up with unusual directness in the following gazel by Baki, the sixteenth century’s most famed Ottoman poet:

My breast is wounded by the grief of alienation and the gall of separation

My heart is a captive of the pain of abandonment and a prisoner of separation

If my bloody tears flow betimes from my eyes, what wonder is this?  
For my heart is shredded by the dagger of the torment of separation

The caravan of peace and patience has departed for the land of annihilation

theorized, how it changes over time, and how it impacts the ways in which we organize our lives and understand our world.

Entitled *The Making of Romantic Love*, Reddy's book is centered about the origins of the 12<sup>th</sup> century European troubadour tradition of *fin'amors* or "courtly love". Troubadour courtly love, as Reddy analyzes it, is intrinsically interesting, because it reveals the origins of a way of thinking that persists today in our own, firmly naturalized thinking about romantic love.

With apologies to Professor Reddy and to those upon whose fields I am trespassing with only borrowed expertise, I am going to extract from Reddy's arguments, a few points that I believe are helpful in thinking and talking productively about the emotional content of romantic love.

In his detailed historical analysis, Reddy introduces and defends an innovative initial proposal. He argues that the 12<sup>th</sup> century concept of "courtly love" originated in reaction to a series of 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> century church reform movements popularly known as the Gregorian Reforms.

Named after Pope Gregory VII, who strove to reform the clergy in the late 11<sup>th</sup> century, these reforms were actually conceptualized and

*Spiritual and material together in a human body but they are always separate — bodily impulses lead to sin & must be resisted —* <sup>17</sup> *sex pleasure eating*

- Sexual behavior—although always polluting to some degree—was permissible only within marriage and for the purpose of procreation.
- Marriage was permanent and theoretically indissoluble.
- The only truly non-sinful life was a monastic, celibate, and abstinent life. Consequently, during the 11<sup>th</sup> and 12 centuries, abbeys, convents, and monasteries burgeoned.

According to Reddy, the *fin'amors*, the courtly love of the troubadours (and female trobaritz) was a reaction to and rejection of the notion that the complexities of love could be reduced to a sinful and self-absorbed appetite. It accepted the existence of sexual desire as appetite but paired this with a notion of “true love”: a pure and self-less longing and devotion that tamed and overwrote sinful desire. Both the reformer and courtly lovers agreed that sexual desire is polluting. But for the troubadour, restraint, self-denial, separation, suffering, and sacrifice, could render desire innocent and even holy.

Giraut de Borneilh (Bourneil) (2<sup>nd</sup> half of the 12<sup>th</sup> c.)

*For love burns and constrains me;*

*And if it was once remote and distant from me*

*a better quote*

*Sufism's for Amara = shadow religion*<sup>19</sup>

( Except...that Ottoman Islam does not necessarily see sex and sexual desires as mortal sin—this is the Christian legacy of the Gregorian Reformation. For the troubadour, sexual feelings are a source of guilt: (Bernart de Ventadorn b. ca 1120)

*I fear and cherish her so well  
And passionately love her so,  
Yet of this love I dare not tell  
Nor ask the gifts she might bestow  
She knowing all of my sorrow and pains  
Treats me with honor and grace when she deigns  
Yet when she deigns it, I make do with less  
Lest blame should fall on her chaste guiltlessness*

The troubadour's beloved does not have or does not permit herself sexual feelings. She pities the torment of the lover and is betimes kind but never sexually engaged. And the <sup>painful</sup> restraint of the lover protects her against <sub>A</sub> any imputation of sinful desire.

( For the Ottoman, socially disruptive sexual behaviors (adultery, public love-making or prostitution) might be seen as sinful and deserving of public

( *And flames here still*  
*Like the candle of the gathering*

*The sweet breeze has blown up flames*  
*From my eye's bud of hope*  
*The lightning-bolt of spring*  
*Has set afire*  
*The rose-bed of my expectations*

( *As your lovers sigh—Aaaaah!*  
*Imagining what it might be*  
*To long for your dark mole*  
*In the black night of separation,*  
*The heart aflame casts out*  
*The burning stars as alms.*

*When you are gone, oh moon,*  
*Even the flower-beds*  
*Speak to me of Hell—*  
*The tree's a flame*  
*Sapling's a flame*  
*Leaf and fruit a flame.*

(

in Puri and an epic poem, the *Gitagovinda* by the 12<sup>th</sup> century poet-saint Jayadeva. My time this morning will allow only a tiny taste of Reddy's detailed analysis but I believe that a taste will be instructive.

The *Gitagovinda* is based on oral tales telling of the god Krishna's physical manifestation as the youthful (blue) cowherd Govinda and his joyous sexual play [līlā] with the Gopi's, cowherd girls who abandon their human loves for him.

Yellow silk and wildflower garlands lie on his dark  
sandal-oiled skin.

Jeweled earrings dangling in play ornament his  
smiling cheeks

Hari [Krishna] revels here as the crowd  
of charming girls  
Revels in seducing him to play

One cowherdess with heavy breasts embraces  
Hari lovingly  
Celebrates him in a melody of love

Another simple girl lured by his wanton  
quivering look  
Meditates intently on the lotus face



consort overcome the emotions that separate them. They engage in real sex. They bite and claw at each other in a frenzy of arousal and climax in an agony of pleasure.

*Held captive by her arms,  
pressed down by the weight of her breasts,  
pierced by her fingernails  
the cup of his lower lip bitten by her teeth  
crushed by the slope of her hips  
bent over by her hand in his hair,  
crazed by the trickling of honey from her lip  
the beautiful beloved somehow obtained delight*

Moreover, in the Orissan context, palace and temple reflect one another. Gods and goddesses are treated like royalty—or, kings and queens are treated like gods and goddesses. Gods engage in sexual activity. Sexual activity among royalty is not something to be sublimated out of existence, it is something to be practiced—in a sense sacramentally—as pleasure

*spiritually significant promptings, encouraged  
by the gods.*

and spirits seem to have been interested in social behaviors including sexual partnerships. They could advance favored partnerships or punish offenses—neglect, insult, indignities, or deception—against one's sexual partners. The pain and frustration occasioned by sexual desires are not experienced because such desires are especially sinful and polluting as in the West, or because they are instructive and point the way to spiritual transcendence as among the Muslim mystics, or because, when done in the correct mood, sexual desire and sexual behavior are the material manifestations of divine sexuality as in Orissa.

~~For~~ For the Heian Buddhist, to live in the world is to desire and all desire is attended by suffering. But for the elites, to live in the world also demands adherence to particular rules of elegant and refined behavior, writing style, dress, *and a spiritual dimension*, and appearance—all of these necessarily appropriate to relations of social rank. *in an elegant and refined way,* One must even suffer elegantly. To fail to follow the rules is to invite the displeasure of the spirits. There is <sup>gross</sup> no distinction in this regard among the various kinds of associations. Sexual associations are *generally* indistinguishable from patronage or business associations, for example. *It's the same vocab. of passion in poetry addressed to partners* Moreover, sexual desire is no more or less special, or sinful, or godlike or *in all such associations as was true of the Ottoman poem with which we began,*

①

Experience Wild Adventure!

# ANCHORAGE

Anchorage Convention & Visitors Bureau

Love as appetite (Amigo-Turiso) desire  
Love - pure love

4 courtly love: "in the shadowy space  
beyond clerical regulations" of [romantic  
literature, music, decorative arts]

5 India "jila" love liaisons - a part of  
divine "play"  
Blava (endless, joy) transient states  
Rasa "The sacred spiritual notes or extract  
of certain of these transient states,  
including sexual states."

6 Japan all this worldly desire is frustrating  
and brings suffering in  
longings for specific partners  
as manifestations of spiritually  
significant assumptions, encouraged  
by the gods.

Anchorage  
Convention &  
Visitors Bureau

N. Fourth Avenue

Anchorage, Alaska

99501-2212

Ph: 907-276-4118

Fax: 907-278-5559

info@anchorage.net

6 "prerequisites" for sexual pleasure  
"included a spiritual dimension"

Explore [www.anchorage.net](http://www.anchorage.net)

Reddy

26-7 Countess Loue — "a recipe for escaping the Gregorian reform's blanket condemnation of all sexual partnerships as sinful and polluting."

34 — Sexual desire is not universal —

45 — Aristocratic speech, "... in aristocratic understanding binding claims and promises were oral in character."

54 1) system of the feud 2) victory a sign of divinely sanctioned authority.

81 ascetic ecstasy / union of the soul

85-89 Gregorian reform summary

92 first Troubadour William 1071-1126

1) aristocratic speech — rule-governed violence

2) flexible kinship — independence & charisma of certain women

3) Clerical reformers obsessive fear of sexual desire

[1073 Gregory VII] house of Cluny (reformers)

99 He beloved as a source of spiritual power

— the working force of a kind of salvation

— inverting the reformers' view

[Heloise & Abelard]

101 the reformers as sex (cunt) obsessed (in will's songs)

102 not misogynistic but anti-clerical

\$35 — Paper

The aristocracy had never as  
wrote to argue sex p.p. matters

(2)

Reddy cont.

108 ethnographic reading (as opposed to a literary reading)

"Only an ethnographic reading opens up the multiple resonances between the silences and the violence of aristocratic practice, on the one hand, the silences and abstractions of troubadour lyric, on the other."

(identifies "the strong tradition of aristocratic women's (limited) participation in rule and uncover its relevance to courtly love."

E.R.

109 "... an effort to grasp ... all aspects of the context that wholly influenced emotional responses."

III "The game of aristocratic silence and speech" <sup>lying, claims, counterclaim, not saying</sup>  
"The expectations of loyalty and generosity were real and strongly felt."  
"trial by combat"

Albigensian  
crusades

117 → 1) Hermits "free-lance ascetics"

2) Monastic orders

3) Reform of the Episcopacy

4) Reform of Marriage, inheritance, and Sexual Behavior  
(nicolaism [clerical marriage])

(earlier marriage left up to the laity)

Innocent III 1198 -

130

[The world of the troubadours and troubadours was a product of the Gregorian Reform.]

3

Reddy cont

Canard as aristocratic speech  
(<sup>over</sup> 300 troub. known by name)

131-2 Bruckner Songs of the Women troubadours  
1. The families of [the lord's or lady's] household

False love and Aristocratic speech  
(true love - false love = loyalty - duplicity)

fin'amors purity of love makes adultery innocent

135 love as appetite - [lust vs love]

137 legitimacy of offspring a post G.R. <sup>category</sup> phenomenon

138 The Art of Ambiguity

The poem is a "fiction" - or is it?

143 "Love breaks with sexuality while embracing it."  
Giddens, The transformation of intimacy

144 Invoking God's Aid

(refined love is a sacred thing)

146 unrequited love as a test; a cover,

151 "... how to give voice to a challenging intensity  
of pain" (pain = the test of love)

153 Assembling the heart

(organizing & disciplining the heart)

158 Beauty of the Cantor

159 The High Price of Success (gender differences)

(4)

165 Cond. (167) Shadow religion with a morality and ritual all its own...

168 Narratives of True Love and Twelfth-Century Common Sense.

169 "...by the close of the twelfth century, aristocratic men and women were relying on the conventions of courtly love to guide practice..."

"tests" (m) rescue, trial by combat, patient waiting...

(w) quiet fidelity, rejection of a captor's advances, overcoming restrictions {husbands fathers}

170 Arthurian Romance

172-76 Wace transl. of the Arthur Legend in ~~Geoffrey~~ Geoffrey of Monmouth HKB

176 - Chrétien de Troyes Lancelot

(Idealization ⇒ negative judgment)

178 "...an effective polemic... against the Gregorian Theology of desire-as-appetite

179 patronage by Comtes Marie of Champagne (1145-98) eldest child of Eleanor of Aquitaine (Louis VII)

183 Irony; Aristocratic Speech in "Lancelot"

Girl pass tests > love

Chrét. concedes "appetite" (lust) but insists on the existence of another kind of emotion that brings lovers together...

Hist. of

William

Marshall

rules of

aristocratic

speech

5

... adultery ... an index<sup>not</sup> of betrayal but of  
loyalty...

(to rescue G., L. rides in a cart like a  
criminal

L's bond w/ G.  
one by loyalty  
not lust

{ (L. able to resist all women except G. —  
or feels no attraction to them because  
the attraction is a consequence of lust/app.  
and not of the bond w/ G.)

{ Bernard & Clairvaux's famous quip "to be  
always with a woman and not to have sexual  
relations with her is more difficult than to  
raise the dead." Byrum, Holy Feasts and Holy Famine 16

Mustafa Ali:



⑥

188: Lancelot's victory over Meleagant "will result, not in the rescue of the queen, but in the remaking of the truth about her." (trial by combat to defend Kay and G.)  
(difference between L & G's love and mere desire)

189 Aristocratic Speech in the Tristan Myth

190 "... Two lovers sought to enjoy an adulterous love within a space of silence?

jealous husband (King Mark)

191 Tristan defends the lie (I didn't have sex with her) - silences all would-be accusers (because none dare face him) rule-governed violence

192 Gottfried von Strassburg ~~Tristan~~ Tristan und Isolde (before 1200)

193 again "adulterous love that shelters within the silence of aristocratic speech"

Mark violates the code

198 "concealing love"

199 ruler does not advance his authority by requiring all that is due to him (a claim demands defending - the silent "must be kept silent")

199 "Lois" of Marie de France

200 "celebrating a shadow religion of love"

207 Sybil of Jerusalem and Guy of Lusignan (1180-87)  
 S. sister of King Baldwin IV of Jerusalem (1174-85)  
 G. one of B.'s household knights ~~the~~  
~~B. dies~~ The two are married despite G.'s lower status.

B. dies S. inherits crown but nobles refuse to be under G.

S. agrees to divorce G. if they will be ruled by her new husband

S. divorces and remarries Guy

208 Arnold of Arles and Ida, Countess of Boulogne (1183-91)

210 Ida is inflamed by frivolous love/lust

211 abducted pleads to Arnold ~~and~~ A. comes  
 is betrayed (by I) tailed and learns a lesson

212 (conventions of courtly love misused)

213 Common Sense Ironies

13<sup>th</sup> C fabliau [the theologians were right - all love is  
 214 appetite] making fun of courtly love  
 only works if one understands the rules

214 True Love and the Pitched Battle: Rare Ideals?

215-16 [in actuality commanders avoided

The pitched battle. ~~for~~ rather pillages, sieges,  
 skirmishes - no risk to main forces

Women went along

217 romantic love did not, in practice, approach the ideal (same as battle and tournament)

219 Conclusion

"longing for association" - ~~not~~ a multiplicity not captured by reduction to a polluting sexual appetite.

Anyone who could marry for sex (who could afford it) could take sex from underlings

"LFA" pre-existed courtly love but was disrupted by the Gregorian Reformation

### Points of Comparison

223 The Bhakti Troubadour: Vaishnavism in Twelfth-Cent Bengal and Orissa

223 Sexual-spiritual res. starkly different from that in Europe

"The contrast between firmness and desire-as-appetite ... had no equivalent in twelfth-century Bengal and Orissa."

224 Demonstrating: ... The wide variety of possible forms of sexual partnerships and of the LFA."

224-5 Code of behavior — ~~not~~ no distinction between flesh and spirit (appetite and pure love) distinction between: coarse This-worldly emotions (bhava) and universal realm of refined mood (Rasa).

Rati = desire for a particular sexual partner

one doesn't buy a farm because one is hungry

9

225 Shringara rasa = erotic mood, The refined counterpart of Rati / IFA with heroic, sublime, godlike or divine sexual partner

mundane love/lust (Rati)

Spiritualized love/lust (Shringara rasa)

"Senses do not passively receive from external objects — project subjective faculties from

the mind through the senses to contact and ... constitute the sensing and experiencing of others"

(constituting not just perceiving)

226 no separation of soul and senses

David Aji "Anxieties of attachment..." Mod. Asian Stud 36 (2002)

The refined life includes rectitude (dharma), acquisition (artha) and pleasure (kama)

"rules of engagement" for kama practicing a refined love/lust (in emulation of the gods)

Gopis  
Cowherd  
girls

227 Devadasis of Puri (rolling in the dust left by a temple dancer's feet)

"ennobling romantic liaisons" (in poetry & drama)

228 love is not a form of heroic self-denial

[Purushotta temple]



<sup>celebrated</sup>  
P. = amorous aspect of Vishnu

230-232 eclectic religion

235-36 Shabta/Shakti the female consort of a god. - related to Tantrism (ritualized sexual practices)

237 Hindu was a muslim Arab name for anyone living beyond the Indus river  
no unified religious sense, many practices

240 Female "sexuality" and spiritual energy  
female sexual capacity is "auspicious"

241 1) abstinence builds sexual powers

2) sexual enjoyment & attachments ensure that powers benefit life & prosperity

sexual capacity is a manifestation of a spiritual power of the material body

↑ power of great gods derives from female consorts (Durga)

242 Durga the Demon slayer (fem. god's avatar of Shakti)

243 Emotional Protocols of Royal Courts

bhakti (deeply felt loyalty to the great kings) worldly context,

244 (class of "enjoyers" - bhuj ruler "enjoys" his kingdom  
works on statecraft / proper conduct of court - he  
bolstered by lit. works drama-love poetry

245 formalized emotionality

The bhavas (emotions plus)

for each bhava (8 primary) a corresponding rasa  
(rasa = dominant mood (impersonal))

lit. = enjoyment of rasa

D. Ali "drama & poetry" shaped the affective habits of people at court."

Shaw and Ali  
Courtly culture

248 kama = sex carried out according to an elaborate protocol

249 The only "polluting" sex was sex without art or reflection

### The "Hard Core" of Tantra

The hard core is cultic alliances with dangerous female deities who could bestow extraordinary powers on adepts.

250-1 Kama

252 Bhakti = "devotion" / "love"

creation of a personal tie b/w worshiper & god/goddess  
bhava becomes the "devoted" attitude

rasa = the joyous experience of love rel.

(natural love  $\Rightarrow$  rasa love)

Govinda  
(Krishna as  
cowherd)

256 Jayadeva's 'Gita govinda'

[Sanskrit poem - sacred text]

257 The Poet Jayadeva Jayadeva

258 LFA in the Gita govinda

adulterous love-lust between Krishna and gopi Radha

(god suffers unrequited love -) Radha is another man's wife

260 viraha - love in separation -

261 Kamadeva god of love sends flower arrows

"killing, stupifying, searific, emaciating and maddening"

"manmathena" = burning w/ passion

262 desire = "all impulses to act or pursue goals in this ephemeral life (samsara)"

264 no distinction between love and lust -  
only a generalized love-longing

266 The Gita Govinda and Dance Ritual at Puri  
267 Videos of dance

## 274 Social Organization, Ritual and Sexuality

Devotion to the deity precludes marriage - devotion to a single person.

288: The "cleansing" of the Krishna legend under British colonialism

288 on Conclusions

289 Hedonization of Tantra

Liberalizing a part of ~~the~~ tradition

Elegance and Compassion in Heian Japan  
(You should never have a woman)

Wang, Wei-yan (State of Guizhou) ~~identical~~ <sup>identical</sup>

290-91 → summary of comparisons

Sexual partnerships = this worldly = all this worldly endeavors are frustrated

The same genre of ardent poetry was used in exchanges between: lovers, officers, kinsmen, sisters-in-law, etc.

— Sexual partnerships could be advanced or thwarted by the gods.

291-2 Buddhism + kami (spirits) worship

297-30 fluidity of marriage (conjugal cohabitation) became ritualized ~~for~~ procedures for high office

- 301 of first the lady's name remained significant
  - husband's name like wife's name (and)
  - family name was not always
  - residence was much from village to village
  - early marriage

301 592-1110 The Empress was a great woman  
 9th & 10th c. Dewa for a long time

prelude

302 940 a time of disruption

idea of power / performance / gift giving

303-4 Elegance, refined, subtle, official behavior  
 Chinese, art, tea, etc.

Rhetoric  
 T. Cantor  
 Sugawara

3087 Waka poetry / elegance / nature / populated by spirits / incantation /  
 social world / "pity"  
 pivot words

310 comments on Waka

311 Gossamer years: Heian Subjectivity

312 Soul is not gendered

Refinement

[bhakti: men and women love. as women (gopi)]  
 the Heian self was a creature of art (ifice) - partly  
 "fictional"

Kagerō nikki = Gossamer tales new genre  
 954-971

321 last paragraph LOVE IS!!

322 The Celestial Splendors of the H. Elite  
 Beauty is young, looks best in refined  
 environment



329 Spiritually meaningful love Affairs

331 Compassion (empathy) divine characteristics  
(caring dog)

342 Conclusion (Japan)

Similarities

- courts governed by elaborate codes of conduct
- religious practices involving priests, monks, nuns
- elaborate temple-based worship
- sacred texts
- meditation
- models of moral reform

Differences

Shameful suffering of J. lovers - heroism of Lauree

Krishna and Radha's love play - Gregorian sexual pollution

348 Luxuria in monastic churches - dancing Yoginis / apsaras / Tantric sex  
(emaciated snakes sucking at sagging breasts)

"Love is not a separable feature of human experience  
independent of social life" (348)

"Emotions do not exist prior to social  
organization" ["arise from an interaction  
between social org. & cultural (norms)"]

Evident differences?

## Evident differences

- 1) understandings about the structure of the world and the place of the human body within it
2. the uses of language in such a world
3. longing for association similar despite differences

### 1) Structure of the world

11<sup>th</sup> Xiao Variant = 'clear line between this world and that (spiritual world)

- God's will enacted through trial by combat
- G. w. e. by the intervention of saints
- spiritual & material meet in human body but do not merge.

350 - bodily impulses: appetites, (sex especially) tempt to sin - sex is polluting

- bodily impulses must be resisted

- The church had to take over by regulating sexual behavior

11<sup>th</sup> c. there came an opportunity for sweeping reform

roles of girl  
3rd Conf. of Japan

Reliance / assistance

COMPARTMENTALIZATION OF  
LIFE AND MIND / RELATION

DISORDERLY STATE OF LIFE (LIFE)  
(The organization of life)

(one must be prepared to impose it  
with violence) — Rel. to trustly  
Love / Defence of love through  
rule of fear

Control of marriage — men's grounds  
claims — threatened by progressive  
reform.

Accepting contradictions (marriage)  
pleasure — idealism / PA / not practical

Sexual pleasure holy —

Silent if possible but modestly revealed  
in sexual intercourse is violently revealed

( 3/6/79 desire )

Kama Desire for pleasure according  
to certain rules.

380 - Contemporary Romantic Love  
Dusty Woman  
Kitch

History of sexuality  
History of Gender

Romantic Love as

Disruptive Discourse (from church)

Shadow religion (alternative to R.C. & P.C.)

2. queer performance (strategy for production of  
meaning and being)